# The Automatability of Occupations in Malaysia: Automatability Profiles of Occupations on the 2017/2018 Critical Occupations List

June 28, 2018







TAE	BLE OF CONTENTS	2
OVE	ERVIEW	4
I.	INTRODUCTION	7
II.	THE AUTOMATABILITY OF OCCUPATIONS IN MALAYSIA	9
III.	AUTOMATABILITY PROFILES	.13
1	. Managing Directors and Chief Executives (1121)	.15
2	. Finance Managers (1211)	.16
3	. Policy and Planning Managers (1213)	.17
4	. Business Services Managers (1214)	.18
5	. Business Services and Administration Managers Not Elsewhere Classified (1219)	.19
6	. Sales and Marketing Managers (1221)	.20
7	. Research and Development Managers (1223)	.21
8	. Manufacturing Managers (1321)	.22
9	. Construction Managers (1323)	.23
1	0. Supply, Distribution, and Related Managers (1324)	.24
1	1. Information and Communications Technology Managers (1511)	.25
1	2. Chemists (2113)	.26
1	3. Geologists and Geophysicists (2114)	.27
1	4. Mathematicians, Actuaries, and Statisticians (2121)	.28
1	5. Industrial and Production Engineers (2141)	.29
1	6. Civil Engineers (2142)	.30
1	7. Mechanical Engineers (2144)	.31
1	8. Chemical Engineers (2145)	.32
1	9. Mining Engineers, Metallurgists, and Related Professionals (2146)	.33
2	0. Engineering Professionals (Excluding Electrotechnology) Not Elsewhere Classified (2149).	.34
2	1. Electrical Engineers (2151)	.35
2	2. Electronic Engineers (2152)	.36
2	3. Telecommunications Engineers (2153)	.37
2	4. Ships Engineers (2171)	.38
2	5. Aircraft Pilots and Related Professionals (2173)	.39
2	6. Manufacturing Professionals (2182)	.40
2	7. Specialist Medical Practitioners (2212)	.41
2	8. Environmental and Occupational Health and Hygiene Professionals (2263)	.42
2	9. University and Higher Education Professional Teachers (2311)	.43
3	0. Accountants (2411)	.44

### **TABLE OF CONTENTS**

31. Financial Analysts (2413)	45
32. Research and Development Professionals (2426)	46
33. Public Relations Professionals (2432)	47
34. Information and Communications Technology (ICT) Sales Professionals (2434)	48
35. Systems Analysts (2511)	49
36. Software Developers (2512)	50
37. Applications Programmers (2514)	51
38. Software and Applications Developers and Analysts Not Elsewhere Classified (2519)	52
39. Database Designers and Administrators (2521)	53
40. Systems Administrators (2522)	54
41. Computer Network Professionals (2523)	55
42. Electrical Engineering Technicians (3113)	56
43. Electronics Engineering Technicians (3114)	57
44. Mechanical Engineering Technicians (3115)	58
45. Physical and Engineering Science Technicians Not Elsewhere Classified (3119)	59
46. Manufacturing Supervisors (3122)	60
47. Construction Supervisors (3123)	61
48. Aircraft Technicians (3151)	62
49. Environmental and Occupational Health Inspectors and Associates (3257)	63
50. Insurance Agents (3321)	64
51. Commercial Sales Agents (3322)	65
52. Buyers (3323)	66
53. Computer Network and Systems Technicians (3513)	67
54. Agricultural and Industrial Machinery Mechanics and Repairers (7233)	68
55. Electrical Mechanics and Fitters (7412)	69
56. Rubber Products Machine Operators (8141)	70
57. Stationary Plant and Machine Operators Not Elsewhere Classified (8189)	71
58. Heavy Truck and Lorry Drivers (8332)	72
APPENDIX 1: METHODOLOGY	73
A. Probability of automation	73
B. Task scores	75
C. Qualitative assessment of automatability	77
APPENDIX 2: ADDITIONAL RESULTS	79
REFERENCES	81

#### **OVERVIEW**

**Digitization, automation, and Industry 4.0 are changing the world of work in Malaysia.** New technologies – cloud computing, 3D printing, blockchain, the Internet of Things to name just a few – are transforming how work is done. These technologies and their predecessors have already shifted the composition of the Malaysian workforce away from tasks that involve repetitive work to tasks that require creative thinking, social intelligence, and the ability to adapt to new situations. The forces of digitization, automation, and Industry 4.0 will increasingly take over even the dynamic, interpersonal tasks that computers have traditionally struggled to automate.

**These forces are likely to have a significant impact on the Malaysian economy: half of all jobs in Malaysia are at high risk of automation.** This report provides an overview of the potential for automation in Malaysia. The report examines the technical potential for the automation of jobs in Malaysia, estimating how many jobs could be automated given existing technologies. This methodology shows that 50 percent of the Malaysian workforce is at high risk of automation, 25 percent is at medium risk, and another 25 percent is at high risk. The share of jobs at high risk of automation in Malaysia is similar to that estimated for the United States.

**However, there are several constraints to automation that will hinder and slow the expansion of automation in Malaysia.** Cost, as well as legislation, regulations, and norms are likely to hinder the adoption of automation technologies in some cases. In other cases, automation will affect the types of jobs that workers do but will not eliminate their occupations entirely.

**Occupations that appear on Malaysia's 2017/2018 Critical Occupations List are subject to these constraints to automation.** The report focuses on the 58 occupations appearing on the 2017/2018 Critical Occupations List. Understanding the automatability of these occupations, which have been shown to be both in shortage and also strategic to Malaysia's economic development, is particularly important because automation may be a potential mechanism to fill the shortages identified. Evidence gathered for this report shows that constraints to automation remain even for occupations that would be technologically feasible to automate. In fact, in the case of each of the 58 occupations on the Critical Occupations List, cost and the lack of penetration of technology beyond top-tier firms are constraints on automatability. The table below summarizes the findings of the report for the COL occupations.

			Evidence of constraints to automation								
Masco code	Masco title		Depth of technological penetration			Cost			Legal, regulatory, normative		ry, ve
			Yes	Mix	No	Yes	Mix	No	Yes	Mix	No
2411	Accountants	96%	0	•	0	0	•	0	0	•	0
8189	Stationary Plant and Machine Operators Not Elsewhere Classified	92%	0	•	0	0	•	0	0	0	
3114	Electronics Engineering Technicians	84%	0	•	0	•	0	0	0	0	•
3151	Aircraft Technicians	84%	•	0	0	•	0	0	0	•	0
3113	Electrical Engineering Technicians	82%	•	0	0		0	0	0		0
8141	Rubber Products Machine Operators	82%	0	•	0	0	•	0	0	0	
3321	Insurance Agents		0	•	0	0	•	0	0		0
7412	Electrical Mechanics and Fitters		•	0	0	•	0	0	0	•	0
3323	Buyers		•	0	0	0	•	0	0	•	0
7233	Agricultural and Industrial Machinery Mechanics and Repairers			0	0	•	0	0	0	0	
1324	Supply, Distribution and Related Managers	59%	•	0	0	0	•	0	0	0	•
3257	Environmental and Occupational Health Inspectors and Associates	53%		0	0	0	•	0	0	•	0
2514	Applications Programmers	48%	0	•	0	0	•	0	0	0	•
3115	Mechanical Engineering Technicians	48%	•	0	0	•	0	0	0	0	•
2413	Financial Analysts	46%	0	•	0	0	•	0	0	•	0
8332	Heavy Truck and Lorry Drivers	41%		0	0	0	•	0	•	0	0
3322	Commercial Sales Agents	39%	0	•	0	0	•	0	0	0	
1214	Business Services Managers	35%		0	0	•	0	0	0	0	
1219	Business Services and Administration Managers Not Elsewhere Classified	35%		0	0	•	0	0	0	0	
3119	Physical and Engineering Science Technicians Not Elsewhere Classified	34%		0	0	•	0	0	0	0	
2114	Geologists and Geophysicists	32%		0	0	•	0	0	0	0	•
2173	Aircraft Pilots and Related Professionals	25%	0	•	0	0		0	•	0	0
1213	Policy and Planning Managers	25%		0	0	0	•	0	0	•	0
2523	Computer Network Professionals	21%		0	0	0	•	0	0	0	
2432	Public Relations Professionals	18%		0	0		0	0	0	0	
3123	Construction Supervisors	17%	•	0	0	•	0	0	0	•	0

## The automatability of occupations on the 2017/2018 Critical Occupations List

2121	Mathematicians, Actuaries and Statisticians	15%	0	•	0	0		0	0	0	
2144	Mechanical Engineers	13%	•	0	0		0	0	0	0	
2152	Electronic Engineers	12%	•	0	0	•	0	0	0	•	0
2434	Information and Communications Technology (ICT) Sales Professionals	11%	0	•	0	0		0	0	0	
2263	Environmental and Occupational Health and Hygiene Professionals	11%	0	•	0	•	0	0	0	•	0
2151	Electrical Engineers	10%		0	0	0		0	0	0	
1121	Managing Directors and Chief Executives	9%	•	0	0	0		0	0	•	0
2512	Software Developers	9%	•	0	0	•	0	0	0	0	
2519	Software and Applications Developers and Analysts Not Elsewhere Classified	9%	•	0	0	0		0	0	0	
2146	Mining Engineers, Metallurgists and Related Professionals	9%	•	0	0	•	0	0	0	0	
1323	Construction Managers	7%	•	0	0	•	0	0	0	0	
1211	Finance Managers	7%	•	0	0	0		0	0		0
2113	Chemists		•	0	0	0	•	0	0	0	
1511	Information and Communications Technology Managers		0	•	0	0		0	0	0	
2171	Ships Engineers		•	0	0	0	•	0	0	0	
2149	Engineering Professionals (Excl. Electrotechnology) Not Elsewhere Classified		•	0	0	•	0	0	0	•	0
2311	University and Higher Education Professional Teachers	3%	0	•	0	0		0	0	0	
1321	Manufacturing Managers	3%	•	0	0	0	•	0	0	0	
2521	Database Designers and Administrators		0	•	0	0		0	0	0	
2522	Systems Administrators	3%	0	•	0	0	•	0	0	0	
3513	Computer Network and Systems Technicians	3%	•	0	0	0	•	0	0	0	
2141	Industrial and Production Engineers	3%	•	0	0		0	0	0		0
2153	Telecommunications Engineers	3%	•	0	0	•	0	0	0	•	0
2142	Civil Engineers	2%	•	0	0	•	0	0	0	•	0
1223	Research and Development Managers	2%	0	•	0	0	•	0	0	0	
2426	Research and Development Professionals	2%	•	0	0	•	0	0	0	0	
2145	Chemical Engineers	2%	0	•	0	•	0	0	0	0	
2182	Manufacturing Professionals	2%	•	0	0	0	•	0	0	0	
3122	Manufacturing Supervisors	2%	0		0	0	•	0	0	0	
1221	Sales and Marketing Managers	1%	0	•	0	0		0	0	0	
2511	Systems Analysts	1%	0		0	0	•	0	0	0	
2212	Specialist Medical Practitioners	0%		0	0	0		0	0		0

Source: World Bank based on Frey and Osborne (2017).

#### I. INTRODUCTION<sup>1</sup>

**Digitization, automation, and Industry 4.0 are changing the world of work in Malaysia.** New technologies – cloud computing, 3D printing, blockchain, the Internet of Things to name just a few – are transforming how work is done. These transformations extend from well-known examples like Grab, which helped kickstart the gig economy in Malaysia, to Hong Leong Bank's use of IBM's Watson to help the bank understand customer emotions. These technologies and their predecessors have already shifted the composition of the Malaysian workforce away from tasks that involve repetitive work to tasks that require creative thinking, social intelligence, and the ability to adapt to new situations. As TalentCorp lays outs in *Visioning Malaysia's Future of Work: A Framework for Action*, in this context Malaysia is faced with the dual tasks of keeping pace with rapid technological development and meeting the talent needs associated with global market demand.

**The potential reach of these changes is significant.** Estimates from countries around the world suggest that the jobs of a significant share of the workforce are at high risk of automation. These estimates judge that the forces behind automation like big data, artificial intelligence (AI), and machine learning will increasingly take over even the dynamic, interpersonal tasks that computers have traditionally struggled to automate. Overall, as one prominent research paper puts it, the automation of almost any task "is largely already technologically possible" (Frey and Osborne 2017).

However, the ultimate impact of digitization, automation, and Industry 4.0 on how people work is dependent on several factors beyond the technological potential for automation. First, firms decide to invest in new technologies based on their costs and benefits, not simply because they are available. In particular, large globally connected firms may be able to afford cutting-edge automation while SMEs continue to rely on labour-intensive technologies. Second, automation may not replace jobs but rather change the jobs that workers do. For instance, computers may replace the role of radiologists in identifying abnormalities in images, but leave radiologists more time to spend determining which radiological tests to order and consulting on diagnoses and treatment (Davenport and Dreyer 2018). Third, laws and regulations may inhibit swift adoption of automation technologies. Continuing the example of radiologists, reform of health insurance and health care legislation and rules will be necessary for AI to truly take off in radiology. Relatedly, norms or preferences may not shift immediately. For instance, though the technologies for e-commerce are well-established globally, less than one percent of retail sales are conducted via e-commerce in Malaysia (Chang and Huynh 2016). Fourth, the new technologies associated with automatability and the improved productivity implied by automation will themselves create new job opportunities and new job titles that cannot be foreseen today. For example, 28 new job titles emerged in Malaysia between 1998 and 2008 (ADB 2018).

**This report examines the susceptibility of occupations in Malaysia to automation.** The report examines the technical potential for the automation of jobs in Malaysia, estimating how many jobs could be automated given existing technologies. This is designed to provide a portrait of how many jobs could be affected by automation and which sectors are more and less vulnerable to the changes associated with digitization, automation, and Industry 4.0. Importantly, the report does not estimate the number of jobs that will actually be lost because of automation.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> This report was prepared by a team comprising Harry Moroz (Economist and Task Team Leader), Renjie Ge (Economist), and Martin Schmidt (Economist), in close collaboration with the Critical Skills Monitoring Committee (CSC) composed of Talent Corporation Malaysia Berhad (TalentCorp) and the Institute of Labour Market Information and Analysis (ILMIA).

The report then focuses on the automatability of occupations included in the 2017/2018 Critical Occupations List (COL). Occupations on the 2017/2018 COL have been identified by the Critical Skills Monitoring Committee (CSC) to be sought-after such that demand for and supply of workers in the COL occupations are mismatched (CSC 2018b). These occupations have also been identified as skilled and as strategic to Malaysia's economic growth and to the development of a knowledge-based economy. Identifying the automatability of these occupations is particularly important because, if feasible, automation may be a potential mechanism to fill the shortages identified.

**Profiles of the COL occupations are provided that address not only the technological feasibility of automation but also factors that make automation more and less likely in practice.** For the COL occupations, the report also considers constraints to automation that go beyond the technical potential to automate the occupation. To do so, the report includes detailed profiles of the 58 COL occupations. In addition to presenting the probability of automating each occupation, these profiles include a discussion of how each occupation is likely to be transformed by automation. The profiles also include a discussion of three constraints to automation: 1) whether firms beyond globally connected top-tier firms adopt automation technologies; 2) whether cost is a constraint to adoption of automation. The detailed profiles are designed to provide a portrait of the technical potential to automate each occupation, of how each occupation may evolve with automation, and of potential constraints to automation beyond technological ones.

#### **II. THE AUTOMATABILITY OF OCCUPATIONS IN MALAYSIA**

**This section presents estimates of the probability of automation for all occupations in the Malaysian workforce.** The probability of automation is adapted from Frey and Osborne (2017), an influential and frequently cited paper, to occupations in Malaysia. The authors estimate the probability of automation based on expert assessments and occupational skills profiles. This probability considers the potential for automating occupations based on whether "engineering bottlenecks" make automation technologically difficult. Adapting the probabilities to Malaysian occupations allows for an estimate of the share of jobs in Malaysia that are at low (probability of 30 percent or less), medium (probability greater than 30 percent but less than 70 percent), and high (probability greater than 70 percent) risk of automation. **Appendix 1** provides a detailed description of how the probabilities are calculated.

**Half of employment in Malaysia is at high risk of automation (Figure 1).** In Malaysia, 50 percent of jobs are at high risk of automation. About a quarter of employment is at low risk and another quarter is at medium risk. This means that half of Malaysia's workforce has jobs with a high probability of being affected by automation, a quarter have jobs with a medium probability of being affected by automation, and another quarter have jobs with a low probability of being affected by automation.



Figure 1: The percentage of the workforce at low, medium, and high risk of automation in 2016

Source: World Bank based on Frey and Osborne (2017) and LFS (2016).

**Around 7 million workers are at high risk of automation. Figure 2** shows the distribution of employment by the probability of automation. Each bar in the figure represents the number of people with a given probability of automation. For example, around 2 million workers in Malaysia have a probability of automation that is between 95 percent and 100 percent. Overall, around 7 million workers are at high risk of automation, nearly 4 million are at medium risk, and more than 3 million are at low risk.

**Jobs with a high probability of automation are likely to be automated more quickly than those with a low probability. Figure 2** can be used as an approximate timeline for automatability, with low risk occupations facing the longest time horizons for automation and the high risk occupations

facing the shortest.<sup>2</sup> There is a cluster of jobs that have very high probabilities of automation (90 percent or more). These are jobs that involve routine tasks and jobs that are likely to be undertaken by computers relatively soon as the cost of robots and sensors declines. There is also a cluster of jobs that have very low probabilities of automation (10 percent or less). These jobs involve creativity, social perceptiveness, persuasion, and social intelligence, tasks that are likely to remain difficult to automate into the future. The distribution of employment in the middle range of automation probabilities is much flatter. In this range, jobs are not at immediate risk but may be automated as improvements are made that enhance the perception and manipulation capabilities of computers (Frey and Osborne 2017).



Figure 2: Employment at low, medium, and high risk of automation in Malaysia in 2016

Source: World Bank based on Frey and Osborne (2017) and LFS (2016).

**The risk of automation varies across sectors of the Malaysian economy (Figure 3).** Nearly 90 percent of employment in the accommodations and food service sector is at high risk of automation. This reflects the advance of technologies in the services sector, such as automated checkout counters and chatbots that replace customer service agents. Indeed, more than 50 percent of employment in the services-dominated wholesale and retail trade and administrative and support service sectors is at high risk. Just over 70 percent of employment is at high risk of automation in the manufacturing sector, reflecting the continued potential to automate the routine tasks that characterize many manufacturing jobs. In contrast, only 9 percent of employment in human health and social work and 10 percent in education are at high risk of automation. This reflects the continued importance of creativity, social perceptiveness, persuasion, and social intelligence in these sectors. Descriptions of automatability by gender, citizenship, education, and wages are available in **Appendix 2**.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> See Frey and Osborne (2017) for more on this interpretation.

Figure 3: Employment at low, medium, and high risk of automation in Malaysia in 2016, by sector



Source: World Bank based on Frey and Osborne (2017) and LFS (2016).

**The share of jobs at high risk of automation in Malaysia is similar to that in the United States.** The percentage of employment at high risk of automation in Malaysia is similar to that of the United States (**Figure 4**). Vietnam and Cambodia, where large shares of employment remain in low-skilled employment, are highly exposed to automation. Singapore, where high-skilled work predominates, is much less exposed than even high-income countries like the United States and Canada.





Source: Chang and Huynh (2016) for Cambodia, Indonesia, the Philippines, Thailand, and Vietnam; Lamb (2015) for Canada; World Bank based on Frey and Osborne (2017) and LFS (2016) for Malaysia; Centre for Strategic Futures (2015) for Singapore; Deloitte (2014) for the United Kingdom; and Frey and Osborne (2017) for the United States.

**Occupations included in the 2017/2018 Critical Occupations List (COL) tend to be at low risk of automation.** Occupations included in the 2017/2018 COL are skilled, sought-after, and strategic. This means that these occupations are mid- or high-skilled occupations; that demand for workers in these occupations is mismatched with supply; and that the occupations are strategic for Malaysia's economic growth and the development of a knowledge-based economy. Because COL occupations are skilled, they tend to involve fewer routine tasks and more oversight and managerial ones. This is reflected in the distribution of COL and non-COL occupations by risk of automation (**Figure 5**). About two-thirds of COL occupations are at low risk of automation, compared to just one-third of non-COL occupations. Conversely, only 10 percent of COL occupations are at high risk of automation compared to nearly 40 percent of non-COL occupations.



Figure 5: Percentage of COL and non-COL occupations by risk of automation in 2016

Source: World Bank based on Frey and Osborne (2017), LFS (2016), and CSC (2018).

#### III. AUTOMATABILITY PROFILES

This section presents detailed profiles of the automatability of each occupation on the **2017/2018 Critical Occupations List.** The profiles are divided into two sections. The occupation overview section provides a description of the occupation, a description of the occupation's main tasks, and a description of the typical attributes of individuals working in that occupation.

- **Description**. The description defines the main activities undertaken by people working in the occupation. These descriptions are drawn from the Malaysian Standard Classification of Occupations (MASCO) 2013, which is used to classify the jobs done by Malaysians into a standardized system of occupations.
- Tasks. The task description reports how important five types of tasks are for each occupation. These tasks are selected because research has shown them to be related to how susceptible an occupation is to automation. The tasks are: 1) *non-routine analytical* tasks that involve creativity and problem-solving (e.g. forming a medical diagnosis); 2) non-routine *interpersonal* tasks that involve interacting with other people (e.g. managing others); and 3) non-routine manual physical tasks that are physical activities that involve adapting to different situations and recognizing language and visual cues (e.g. janitorial services). These three types of non-routine tasks are more challenging to automate because they cannot be described in simple rules that can be followed by a computer. Though still more challenging to automate, advances in machine learning, artificial intelligence, and robotics mean that automation of these tasks is now a possibility. The other two types of tasks are: 4) routine *manual* tasks that involve repeating the same physical procedure (e.g. car assembly); and 5) routine cognitive tasks that involve repeating the same analytical procedure (e.g. record keeping). These two types of routine tasks are less challenging to automate since they can generally be described in simple rules a computer can follow. Each task is assigned a score on a scale from 1 indicating that the task is not important in the occupation to 5 indicating that the task is extremely important. The score is taken from O\*NET, a detailed database of occupational information collected from workers and experts in the United States.<sup>3</sup>
- Attributes. The attribute description presents the typical attributes of individuals working in the occupation. The information is taken from the 2016 Labour Force Survey (LFS) and the 2015 Salary and Wages Survey. Information is unavailable for some occupations, which have too few observations in the LFS or SWS. These cases are indicated by N/A.

The automatability section describes the probability that the occupation will be automated, how the occupation will be affected by automation, and the potential constraints to automation.

- **Probability of automation**. The profile reports the probability that the entire occupation will be automated given existing technologies. The higher the probability, the more likely the occupation is to be automated. The probability is based on expert assessments and the skills profiles of the occupations as described in Frey and Osborne (2017).
- **Transformation by automation.** The impact of automation on occupations may be to transform them, rather than to eliminate them entirely. That is, automation may affect one or a group of the tasks that compose an occupation, eliminating some tasks and making others more important. To take this possibility into account, the profile describes how the occupation is likely to be transformed by automation based on the importance of routine and non-routine tasks in the occupation and based on assessments by experts in data science, human resources, and industry in Malaysia.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> For additional information on O\*NET, see <u>https://www.onetonline.org/</u> (last accessed June 28, 2018).

• **Constraints to automation.** While automation may be technologically possible, there are other potential barriers to automating occupations and tasks. There are three important barriers: 1) only top-tier firms may be able to access new technologies; 2) the cost of these technologies may be prohibitively expensive; and 3) there may be legal, regulatory, or normative factors that impede the adoption of the technologies. To take this possibility into account, the profile describes the presence of each of these three constraints based on assessments by experts in data science, human resources, and industry in Malaysia. The profile indicates where constraints are present and not present, and where evidence is mixed.

**Figure 6** is a sample profile describing each of the sections. A detailed description of the methodology used to compile the automatability profiles is provided in **Appendix 1**.



#### Figure 6: Sample automatability profile

### 1. Managing Directors and Chief Executives (1121)



#### 2. Finance Managers (1211) **Occupation Overview** Description: Finance Managers plan, organise, direct, control, and coordinate activities concerning financial operations, and participate in formulating financial policy in consultation with senior managers and other managers in the department and with other divisions. Task importance (1-5) Tasks: Finance Managers 3.7 Non-routine analytical undertake routine cognitive Non-routine interpersonal 3.9 tasks, and non-routine Non-routine manual physical 1.5 interpersonal and analytical Routine cognitive 4.1 tasks. Routine manual 1.8 1 2 3 4 5 **Gender**: 63% female Age: 38-47 years old Wage: 4,000-8,000 RM/month Most common education level: Degree Most common industries: Most common fields of study: Financial and insurance Social sciences, business, and law Professional, scientific, and technical Science, mathematics, and computing activities Automatability What is the probability that this occupation will be automated given current technology? **Low risk Medium risk High Risk** 70% 0% 10% 20% 30% 40% 50% 60% 80% 90% 100% How will this occupation be transformed by automation? Although Finance Managers have a low risk of automation overall, the routine cognitive tasks that they undertake may be automated. Some of the inputs used by Finance Managers are standardized (e.g. spreadsheets and databases), which means that tasks related to analysis of these inputs could be automated. At the same time, Finance Managers interact with the chief executive and other senior managers, an activity which is less susceptible to automation. Laws and regulations related to the submission of financial regulatory documents may be a barrier to automation.

Potential constraints to automation of this occupation		Mix	No
Is the depth of technological penetration a constraint to automation?	•	0	0
Is the cost of new technologies a constraint to automation?	0	•	0
Are there legal, regulatory, or normative constraints to automation?	0	•	0

#### 3. Policy and Planning Managers (1213)



Are there legal, regulatory, or normative constraints to automation?

Ο

0



#### 4. Business Services Managers (1214)



#### 5. Business Services and Administration Managers Not Elsewhere Classified (1219)

6. Sale	s and Ma	rketing	Managers	(1221)	
---------	----------	---------	----------	--------	--





#### 7. Research and Development Managers (1223)





is the depth of teenhological penetration a constraint to automation.			
Is the cost of new technologies a constraint to automation?	0		0
Are there legal, regulatory, or normative constraints to automation?	0	0	



#### 9. Construction Managers (1323)



#### 10. Supply, Distribution, and Related Managers (1324)



#### **11. Information and Communications Technology Managers (1511)**

#### **Occupation Overview** Description: Chemists conduct research, improve or develop concepts, theories, and operational methods, or apply scientific knowledge relating to chemistry, mainly to test, develop, and improve materials and industrial products and processes. Task importance (1-5) Non-routine analytical 4.1 Tasks: Chemists undertake Non-routine interpersonal 3.1 non-routine analytical tasks Non-routine manual physical 2.1 and routine cognitive tasks. 3.8 **Routine cognitive Routine manual** 2.5 1 2 3 4 5 Gender: N/A Age: N/A Wage: N/A Most common education level: N/A Most common industries: N/A Most common fields of study: N/A **Automatability** What is the probability that this occupation will be automated given current technology? **Medium risk Low risk High Risk** 0% 10% 20% 30% 40% 50% 60% 70% 80% 90% 100% How will this occupation be transformed by automation? Although Chemists have a low risk of automation overall, the routine cognitive tasks that they undertake may be automated. Advances in computer modelling allow for simulations of many chemical interactions, which may reduce the number of chemists needed and free others to focus on higher-level tasks. The tasks of industrial chemists are likely to be more susceptible to automation than those of research chemists because the work of industrial chemists involves less originality.

Potential constraints to automation of this occupation	Yes	Mix	No
Is the depth of technological penetration a constraint to automation?	•	0	0
Is the cost of new technologies a constraint to automation?	0	•	0
Are there legal, regulatory, or normative constraints to automation?	0	0	

#### 12. Chemists (2113)

#### 13. Geologists and Geophysicists (2114)





#### 14. Mathematicians, Actuaries, and Statisticians (2121)

Potential constraints to automation of this occupation Yes Mix No Ο Is the depth of technological penetration a constraint to automation? Ο Ο Ο Is the cost of new technologies a constraint to automation? Ο Ο Are there legal, regulatory, or normative constraints to automation? 

#### **15. Industrial and Production Engineers (2141)**





#### 16. Civil Engineers (2142)



#### **17. Mechanical Engineers (2144)**

#### 18. Chemical Engineers (2145)



#### 19. Mining Engineers, Metallurgists, and Related Professionals (2146)



## 20. Engineering Professionals (Excluding Electrotechnology) Not Elsewhere Classified (2149)

Occupation Overview										
<b>Description</b> : Engineering Professionals (Excluding Electrotechnology) Not Elsewhere Classified include job titles such as Building Surveyor Grade J41, Factories and Machinery Inspector Grade J41, Process Engineer, and Quality Control Engineer that are not classified in other occupations. <b>Task importance (1-5)</b>										
Tasks: Profession Electrote Elsewhere Cla non-routine and routine	Engineering hals (Excludi chnology) N assified und e analytical t e cognitive ta	g ot ertake asks asks.	Nor Non-ro Non-routi	n-routine utine inte ne manua Routine Routi	analytic erperson al physic e cognitiv ne manu	al al al ve al	2	3	4 3 1 3 2 4	.0 .3 .8 .6 .0 5
Gender: 40% Wage: 3,900- Most commo • Manufactu • Construct	Gender: 40% femaleAge: 30-35 years oldWage: 3,900-5,000 RM/monthMost common education level: DegreeMost common industries:Most common fields of study:• Manufacturing• Engineering, manufacturing, and• Constructionconstruction									
			Auto	matabil	ity					
What is the probability that this occupation will be automated given current technology?										
what is the	probability	that this t	Jecupati		eauton	lateu gi	ven cui	I ent te	cinio	logy:
	Low risk	% 30%	Me 40%	edium ris	sk 60%	70%	High	Risk 90%	100	logy :
what is the	Lowrisk	% 30%	Me 40%	edium ris	sk 60%	70%	High	Risk 90%	100	10gy : )%
Although Englow risk of au • Tasks of erequireme • Tasks that requireme • Other task the need performan	Low risk Low risk 10% 20 How with dineering Pro- utomation ov engineers the ents are unlist involve occents imposed so are more l for mainter nce, which re	<b>30%</b> <b>30%</b> <b>ill this occ</b> <i>ofessionals of</i> <i>eerall, the re</i> at involve p kely to be a cupational d by laws a ikely to be a nance (e.g. educes the	Me 40% upation (Excl. Electory outine cog outine cog automate safety an nd regula automate an air co need for	<b>50%</b> <b>be trans</b> <i>ctrotechr.</i> <i>gnitive ta</i> and scop d. d health ations. ed, such a onditioni mainten:	60% formed hology) N hology or bing work may also s when t ng chille ance).	70% by auto fot Elsev they und k and ga b face b echnolo er plant	High 80% mation where Cla dertake r athering arriers t gical imp is auto	<b>Risk 90% ?</b> <i>assified may be techni techni to auto</i> proven mated	100 have a autom cal and matior nents r to op	a very nated. d user n from reduce timise

Is the cost of new technologies a constraint to automation?		0	0
Are there legal, regulatory, or normative constraints to automation?	0		0

21. Electrical Engineers	[2151]	)
--------------------------	--------	---





#### 22. Electronic Engineers (2152)

Are there legal, regulatory, or normative constraints to automation?

0

Ο


#### 23. Telecommunications Engineers (2153)



#### 24. Ships Engineers (2171)



#### 25. Aircraft Pilots and Related Professionals (2173)

#### **Occupation Overview Description**: Manufacturing Professionals conduct research and improve or develop concepts, theories, and operational methods, or apply existing knowledge concerning quality assurance and the production of food, paper, and other materials. Task importance (1-5) Tasks: Manufacturing Non-routine analytical 3.1 Professionals undertake Non-routine interpersonal 3.8 routine cognitive and manual Non-routine manual physical 2.4 tasks, and non-routine 3.9 **Routine cognitive** interpersonal tasks. **Routine manual** 3.5 1 2 3 4 5 Gender: 31% female Age: 33-39 years old Wage: 3,145-4,100 RM/month Most common education level: Degree Most common industries: Most common fields of study: Engineering, manufacturing, and construction Manufacturing Social sciences, business, and law • **Automatability** What is the probability that this occupation will be automated given current technology? Lowrisk **Medium risk High Risk** 0% 10% 20% 30% 40% 50% 60% 70% 80% 90% 100% How will this occupation be transformed by automation? Although Manufacturing Professionals have a very low risk of automation overall, the routine cognitive and routine manual tasks that they undertake may be automated. The tasks of Manufacturing Professionals are likely to be automatable for large operations with large production runs (e.g. manufacturing of mass market soft drinks). The tasks of Manufacturing Professionals in the electronics sector - such as inspection, testing, and equipment design – are already automated to a significant degree.

### 26. Manufacturing Professionals (2182)

• However, process design tasks are more difficult to automate.

Potential constraints to automation of this occupation		Mix	No
Is the depth of technological penetration a constraint to automation?		0	0
Is the cost of new technologies a constraint to automation?	0	•	0
Are there legal, regulatory, or normative constraints to automation?	0	0	

### 27. Specialist Medical Practitioners (2212)



#### **Occupation Overview** Description: Environmental and Occupational Health and Hygiene Professionals assess, plan, and conduct programmes to identify, monitor, and control environmental factors that can potentially affect human health to ensure safe and healthy workplaces, and to prevent disease or injury caused by chemical, physical, radiological, and biological agents or ergonomic factors. Task importance (1-5) Tasks: Environmental and Occupational Health and Non-routine analytical 3.8 **Hygiene** Professionals Non-routine interpersonal 3.8 undertake non-routine Non-routine manual physical 2.1 analytical and interpersonal **Routine cognitive** 3.8 tasks, and routine cognitive Routine manual 1.7 tasks. 2 3 1 4 5 **Gender**: 18% female Age: 29-34 years old Most common education level: Diploma/Certificate **Wage**: 3.145-4.144 RM/month Most common industries: Most common fields of study: Public administration and defence; Health and welfare • compulsory social security Human health and social work activities Automatability What is the probability that this occupation will be automated given current technology? **Low risk Medium risk High Risk** 0% 10% 20% 30% 40% 50% 60% 70% 80% 90% 100% How will this occupation be transformed by automation? Although Environmental and Occupational Health and Hygiene Professionals have a low risk of automation overall, the routine cognitive tasks that they undertake may be automated. Supervisory control and data acquisition (SCADA) systems may facilitate automation of the tasks performed by Environmental and Occupational Health and Hygiene Professionals. However, cost-effectiveness is a significant barrier, as such systems require facility redesign. Health, safety, and environmental regulations may be a constraint to automation. Potential constraints to automation of this occupation Yes Mix No Ο Is the depth of technological penetration a constraint to automation? Ο 0 Is the cost of new technologies a constraint to automation? Ο Ο

#### 28. Environmental and Occupational Health and Hygiene Professionals (2263)

Are there legal, regulatory, or normative constraints to automation?

Ο

Ο



#### 29. University and Higher Education Professional Teachers (2311)

#### **30. Accountants (2411)**



Is the cost of new technologies a constraint to automation? O • Are there legal, regulatory, or normative constraints to automation? O •

0



#### 31. Financial Analysts (2413)



#### 32. Research and Development Professionals (2426)



#### 33. Public Relations Professionals (2432)



#### 34. Information and Communications Technology (ICT) Sales Professionals (2434)



#### 35. Systems Analysts (2511)

### 36. Software Developers (2512)





#### 37. Applications Programmers (2514)

# 38. Software and Applications Developers and Analysts Not Elsewhere Classified (2519)



Is the cost of new technologies a constraint to automation?OAre there legal, regulatory, or normative constraints to automation?O

Occupation Overview								
<b>Description</b> : Database Designers and Administrators design, develop, control, maintain, and support the optimal performance and security of databases.								
Task importance (1-5)								
Tasks: Database Designers and Administrators undertake non- routine analytical tasks and routine cognitive tasks.Non-routine analytical Non-routine manual physical Routine cognitive Routine manual12	3.7 2.7 2.0 3.6 2.4 3 4 5							
Gender: N/A Age: N/A								
Wage: N/AMost common education le	evel: N/A							
Most common industries: N/A Most common fields of stu	dy: N/A							
Automatability								
What is the probability that this occupation will be automated given c	irrent technology?							
Lowrisk Mediumrisk Hig	hRisk							
0% 10% 20% 30% 40% 50% 60% 70% 80%	90% 100%							
How will this occupation be transformed by automatic	on?							
<ul> <li>Although Database Designers and Administrators have a very low risk of automation overall, the routine cognitive tasks that they undertake may be automated.</li> <li>The decision making involved in the tasks of Database Designers and Administrators tends to be capturable by algorithms. However, top-tier firms are likely to invest continuously in</li> </ul>								
updating databases, and so may require numans to oversee this process.	X M X							
Potential constraints to automation of this occupation								
	Yes Mix No							
Is the depth of technological penetration a constraint to automation?	$\begin{array}{c c} Yes & Mix & No \\ \hline \bigcirc & \bullet & \bigcirc \\ \hline \end{array}$							
Is the depth of technological penetration a constraint to automation? Is the cost of new technologies a constraint to automation?	Yes         Mix         No           O         •         O           O         •         O           O         •         O							

## 39. Database Designers and Administrators (2521)



#### 40. Systems Administrators (2522)



#### 41. Computer Network Professionals (2523)



#### 42. Electrical Engineering Technicians (3113)

	Occupation Overview												
D re re	escription esearch, and epair of elec	: Electro d in the ctronic e	onics En design, quipme	gineer manu nt.	ing Tech facture, a	nicians p ssembly	erform ( constru	cechnica ction, o	ıl tasks peratio	to aio n, mai	d in ele intenan	ctroni ce, an	ic Id
	Task importance (1-5)												
<b>Т</b> ] с(	<b>`asks</b> : Elect Fechnicians ognitive tas analy	ronics E underta ks and n ytical tas	ngineer ike routi ion-rout sks.	ing ne ine	No Non-ro Non-rout	on-routin outine int ine manu Routir Rout	e analytio terpersor 1al physio 1e cogniti ine mant	cal nal cal ve nal	2	3	4	3.4 2.9 2.6 4.0 2.7 5	
G	<b>ender</b> : 14%	6 female		.1	А	<b>ge</b> : 29-3	3 years o	ld		D . 1	10		
	/age: 2,300	-2,600 F on indu	RM/mon stries:	th	N N	lost com lost com	mon edu	ucation	level:	Diplon	na/Cert	ificate	e
•	Manufact	uring	50105.		•	Engin	eering, m	anufact	uring, a	and co	nstructi	on	
					Aut	omatabi	litv						_
١	What is the	e probał	oility th	at this	occupat	ion will	be auton	nated g	iven cu	ırrent	techno	logy	?
		Low	risk		M	edium r	isk	_	Hig	hRisk	r		
		2011	11011			ourunn		Ī			-		
									04	<b>70</b>			
	00/			200/	4 00/-	50%	( 00/	<b>700</b> /				~ ~ /	
	0%	10%	20%	30%	40%	5070	60%	/0%	80%	90	% 10	0%	
	0%	10% Ho	20% w will t	his oc	cupation	be tran	60% sformed	by aut	80% omatio	90 <sup>0</sup> n?	% 10	0%	
	0% Although I rot	10% Ho Electron utine and	20% w will t ics Engir alytical t	<b>his oc</b> neering asks th	<b>cupation</b> Technici at they u	<b>be tran</b> ans have ndertake	sformed a high ri: may be n	<b>by aut</b> sk of aut nore dif	80% omatio tomatic ficult to	90 n? on over auton	<b>% 10</b> rall, the nate.	<b>0%</b> non-	
•	0% Although l rou The rese automate troublesh	10% Ho Electron atine and arch tas e, as well nooting a	20% w will t ics Engir alytical t sks unde l as the n and hand	his oc neering asks th ertaker nanual dling c	<i>Technici</i> <i>at they u</i> by Elec aspects c	<b>be tran</b> ans have ndertake tronics E of the occ	sformed a high ris may be n Engineeri upation t upment.	by auto sk of auto nore difj ng Tech hat can	80% omatio tomatic ficult to nnicians be invo	90 on? on over o auton s may olved in	<b>% 10</b> call, the nate. be diff n activit	non- icult t ies lik	to ke
•	0% Although I rou The rese automate troublesh However environm	10% Ho Electron atine and arch tas e, as well nooting a r, the tas nents, su	20% w will t ics Engir alytical t sks unde l as the n and hand ks of Ele uch as wo	his oc his oc asks th ertaker nanual dling c ctronic orksho	<i>Technici</i> <i>at they u</i> by Elec aspects c ertain typ s Engine ps, which	<b>be tran</b> ans have ndertake tronics E of the occ bes of equ ering Tec n increase	sformed a high ris may be r Engineeri upation t upment. chnicians es the lik	by auto sk of auto nore difj ng Tech hat can tend to elihood	80% omatio ficult to nnicians be invo be und of auto	90 on? on over o auton s may olved in olved in ertake omation	% 10 <i>call, the</i> <i>nate.</i> be diff n activit n in cor n.	<b>0%</b> non- icult t ies lik itrolle	to ke ed
•	0% Although I rou The rese automate troublesh However environm	10% Ho Electron atine and arch tas e, as well nooting a ; the tash nents, su tential o	20% w will t ics Engir alytical t sks unde l as the n and hand ks of Ele uch as wo	his oc his oc neering asks th ertaker nanual dling c ctronic orksho	<i>Technici</i> <i>at they un</i> by Elec aspects c ertain typ s Engine ps, which	be tran ans have ndertake tronics E of the occo bes of equering Teco increase	sformed a high ris may be n Engineeri upation t upation t shnicians es the like	by auto by auto sk of auto nore difj ng Tech chat can tend to elihood	80% omatio tomatic ficult to nnicians be invo be und of auto	90 <sup>o</sup> on? on over o auton s may olved in olved in ertake omation Yes	% 10 rall, the nate. be diff n activit n in cor n. <u>Mix</u>	0% non- icult t ies lik trolle No	to ce ed
•	0% Although I rou The rese automate troublesh However environm Pot Is the o	10% Ho Electron atine and arch tas e, as well nooting a t, the tash nents, su tential o depth of	20% w will t ics Engir alytical t sks unde l as the n and hand ks of Ele ich as we constrat	his oc his oc neering asks th ertaker nanual dling c ctronic orksho orksho ogical	Technici at they un by Elec aspects of ertain types Engined ps, which automation	be tran ans have ndertake tronics E of the occ oes of equ ering Tec n increase ion of th on a con	sformed a high ris may be ris Engineeri upation t upation t ipment. Chnicians es the like tis occup straint to	by aut by aut sk of aut nore difj ng Tech that can tend to elihood ation automa	80% omatio tomatic ficult to nnicians be invo be und of auto	90 on over o auton s may olved in ertake mation Yes O	% 10 rall, the nate. be diff n activit n in cor n. Mix ●	non- icult t ies lik trolle	to ce ed
•	0% Although I rou The rese automate troublesh However environn Pot Is the o	10% Ho Electron arch tas e, as well nooting a r, the tas nents, su tential o depth of Is th	20% w will t ics Engir alytical t isks unde l as the n and hand ks of Ele ich as we constrai technol e cost of	his oc his oc neering asks th ertaker nanual dling c ctronic orksho nts to ogical	<i>Technici</i> <i>at they u</i> by Elec aspects c ertain typ s Engine ps, which automat penetrati	be tran ans have ndertake tronics E of the occ oes of equ ering Tec n increase tion of the on a consi	sformed a high ris may be n Engineeri upation t upation t ipment. chnicians es the like tis occup straint to	by automation	80% omatio tomatic ficult to nnicians be invo be und of auto	90 on? on over o auton s may olved in ertake omation Yes O	% 10 rall, the nate. be diff n activit n in cor n. Mix ● ○	non- icult t ices lik atrolle	to ce ed

### 43. Electronics Engineering Technicians (3114)



#### 44. Mechanical Engineering Technicians (3115)



#### 45. Physical and Engineering Science Technicians Not Elsewhere Classified (3119)



#### 46. Manufacturing Supervisors (3122)



#### **47. Construction Supervisors (3123)**



#### 48. Aircraft Technicians (3151)

Occupation Overview							
<b>Description</b> : Environmental and Occupational Health Inspe environmental factors that can affect human health, occupational or service process in accordance with related laws and regulation	ectors and Associates inspect safety, and the goods production as.						
Task importance (1-5)							
Tasks: Environmental and Occupational Health Inspectors and Associates undertake routine cognitive tasks and non-routine analytical tasks.Non-routine analytical Non-routine manual physical Routine cognitive 	3.4 3.2 2.7 4.0 2.6 1 2 3 4 5						
Gender: 45% female Age: 29-32 years of	ld						
Wage: 1,850-2,500 RM/monthMost common edu	ication level: Upper secondary						
Most common industries: Most common fiel	ds of study:						
Manufacturing     Engineering, magental	anufacturing, and construction						
Automatability							
What is the probability that this occupation will be automat	ed given current technology?						
Lowrisk Mediumrisk	High Risk						
53%	I						
53%							
0% 10% 20% 30% 40% 50% 60% 70	0% 80% 90% 100%						
<ul> <li>0% 10% 20% 30% 40% 50% 60% 70</li> <li>How will this occupation be transformed by</li> <li>Although Environmental and Occupational Health Inspectors and A automation overall, the non-routine analytical tasks that they und automate.</li> <li>Supervisory control and data acquisition (SCADA) systems acquisition and analysis tasks of Environmental and Occup Associates.</li> <li>However, cost-effectiveness is a significant barrier, as sucfacilities. Additionally, the variety of facilities to be inspected challenging.</li> <li>Legal and regulatory requirements related to the environmental negative to be constraints to automation.</li> </ul>	0%       80%       90%       100%         automation?         Associates have a medium risk of dertake may be more difficult to         are likely to automate the data pational Health Inspectors and         ch systems require redesign of ed is likely to make automation         at and to occupational safety and						
<ul> <li>0% 10% 20% 30% 40% 50% 60% 70 How will this occupation be transformed by</li> <li>Although Environmental and Occupational Health Inspectors and A automation overall, the non-routine analytical tasks that they und automate.</li> <li>Supervisory control and data acquisition (SCADA) systems acquisition and analysis tasks of Environmental and Occup Associates.</li> <li>However, cost-effectiveness is a significant barrier, as suc facilities. Additionally, the variety of facilities to be inspected challenging.</li> <li>Legal and regulatory requirements related to the environment health are likely to be constraints to automation.</li> </ul>	0%       80%       90%       100%         automation?         Associates have a medium risk of dertake may be more difficult to         are likely to automate the data pational Health Inspectors and         ch systems require redesign of ed is likely to make automation         and to occupational safety and         on       Yes       Mix       No						
<ul> <li>0% 10% 20% 30% 40% 50% 60% 70</li> <li>How will this occupation be transformed by</li> <li>Although Environmental and Occupational Health Inspectors and A automation overall, the non-routine analytical tasks that they und automate.</li> <li>Supervisory control and data acquisition (SCADA) systems acquisition and analysis tasks of Environmental and Occup Associates.</li> <li>However, cost-effectiveness is a significant barrier, as sucfacilities. Additionally, the variety of facilities to be inspected challenging.</li> <li>Legal and regulatory requirements related to the environment health are likely to be constraints to automation.</li> </ul>	0%       80%       90%       100%         automation?         Associates have a medium risk of dertake may be more difficult to         are likely to automate the data pational Health Inspectors and         are likely to automate the data pational Health Inspectors and         and the systems require redesign of ed is likely to make automation         and to occupational safety and         on         Yes         Mix       No         tomation?						
<ul> <li>0% 10% 20% 30% 40% 50% 60% 70 How will this occupation be transformed by</li> <li>Although Environmental and Occupational Health Inspectors and A automation overall, the non-routine analytical tasks that they und automate.</li> <li>Supervisory control and data acquisition (SCADA) systems acquisition and analysis tasks of Environmental and Occup Associates.</li> <li>However, cost-effectiveness is a significant barrier, as suc facilities. Additionally, the variety of facilities to be inspected challenging.</li> <li>Legal and regulatory requirements related to the environment health are likely to be constraints to automation.</li> <li>Potential constraints to automation of this occupation Is the depth of technological penetration a constraint to automation.</li> </ul>	0%       80%       90%       100%         automation?         Associates have a medium risk of dertake may be more difficult to         are likely to automate the data pational Health Inspectors and         are likely to automate the data pational Health Inspectors and         and the systems require redesign of ed is likely to make automation         and to occupational safety and         on Yes Mix No         on O         tomation?         0       0						
<ul> <li>0% 10% 20% 30% 40% 50% 60% 70 How will this occupation be transformed by Although Environmental and Occupational Health Inspectors and A automation overall, the non-routine analytical tasks that they und automate.</li> <li>Supervisory control and data acquisition (SCADA) systems acquisition and analysis tasks of Environmental and Occur Associates.</li> <li>However, cost-effectiveness is a significant barrier, as suc facilities. Additionally, the variety of facilities to be inspecte challenging.</li> <li>Legal and regulatory requirements related to the environment health are likely to be constraints to automation.</li> </ul> Potential constraints to automation of this occupati Is the depth of technological penetration a constraint to au Are there legal, regulatory, or normative constraints to automation.	0%       80%       90%       100%         automation?         Associates have a medium risk of dertake may be more difficult to         are likely to automate the data pational Health Inspectors and         are likely to automate the data pational Health Inspectors and         and the systems require redesign of ed is likely to make automation         and to occupational safety and         on Yes Mix No tomation?         O         tomation?						

### 49. Environmental and Occupational Health Inspectors and Associates (3257)



#### 50. Insurance Agents (3321)



#### 51. Commercial Sales Agents (3322)



52. Buyers (3323)



#### 53. Computer Network and Systems Technicians (3513)

Ο

Ο

Are there legal, regulatory, or normative constraints to automation?



#### 54. Agricultural and Industrial Machinery Mechanics and Repairers (7233)

#### 55. Electrical Mechanics and Fitters (7412) Occupation Overview

Description: Electrical Mechanics and Fitters fit, adjust, install, service, and repair electrical machinery and other electrical apparatus and equipment in buildings, factories, workshops, or other places. Task importance (1-5) **Tasks**: Electrical Mechanics Non-routine analytical 3.2 and Fitters undertake routine Non-routine interpersonal 3.0 cognitive tasks, and non-Non-routine manual physical 3.3 routine manual physical and **Routine cognitive** 3.9 analytical tasks. Routine manual 2.8 2 1 3 4 5 **Gender**: 2% female Age: 30-36 years old Wage: 1,630-1,900 RM/month Most common education level: Upper secondary Most common industries: Most common fields of study: Construction Engineering, manufacturing, and construction • Manufacturing • Automatability What is the probability that this occupation will be automated given current technology? Lowrisk **Medium risk High Risk** 30% 60% 70% 0% 10% 20% 40% 50% 80% 90% 100% How will this occupation be transformed by automation? Although Electrical Mechanics and Fitters have a high-medium risk of automation overall, the nonroutine manual physical and analytical tasks that they undertake may be more difficult to automate. The tasks of Electrical Mechanics and Fitters that involve monitoring equipment for faults are more likely to be automated. However, the manual tasks involved in installing and repairing equipment are likely to be more difficult to automate. The large variety of facilities in which Electrical Mechanics and Fitters work may also make automation challenging.

• Approvals required for safety reasons may be a barrier to automation.

Potential constraints to automation of this occupation		Mix	No
Is the depth of technological penetration a constraint to automation?	•	0	0
Is the cost of new technologies a constraint to automation?	•	0	0
Are there legal, regulatory, or normative constraints to automation?	0		0

### 56. Rubber Products Machine Operators (8141)





#### 57. Stationary Plant and Machine Operators Not Elsewhere Classified (8189)



# 58. Heavy Truck and Lorry Drivers (8332)

Are there legal, regulatory, or normative constraints to automation?

Ο

Ο
## **APPENDIX 1: METHODOLOGY**

## A. Probability of automation

This report draws on the findings of Frey and Osborne (2017), an influential and heavily cited paper that estimates the automatability of occupations in the United States. The authors argue that automation is possible for most tasks, except where "engineering bottlenecks to computerisation" arise. They define three such bottlenecks – tasks involving perception and manipulation, tasks involving creative intelligence, and tasks involving social intelligence – and identify variables in O\*NET, a large database of occupational information in the United States, that measure these bottlenecks. The authors then develop a model that relates the O\*NET variables to occupations that have been labelled as automatable or not automatable by a group of machine learning researchers. This approach allows the authors to estimate the probability of automation at 30 percent and below and for "high" risk of automation at 70 percent and above.

This report adapts the probability of automation estimated in Frey and Osborne (2017) to occupations in Malaysia. Frey and Osborne (2017) provide automation probabilities for occupations coded in SOC-2010 at the 6-digit level<sup>4</sup>, the occupational classification scheme used by federal statistical agencies in the United States. These probabilities must be translated into MASCO-2013, the occupational classification scheme used by the Government of Malaysia. MASCO-2013 is created based on the international occupational classification scheme ISCO with revisions to meet the specific needs of the Malaysian labour market. This allows for a transitional mapping of SOC-2010 occupations into ISCO-2008 using an established crosswalk, before ISCO-2008 occupations are translated into MASCO-2013 using a crosswalk created for this report.

To translate the automatability probabilities from SOC-2010 into MASCO-2013 at the 4-digit occupation level, the 702 SOC-2010 occupations in Frey and Osborne (2017) are mapped to ISCO-2008 using a crosswalk file provided by the United States Bureau of Labour Statistics.<sup>5</sup> Where multiple SOC-2010 occupations map to a single ISCO-2008 occupation, a simple average of the automatability probabilities is taken to obtain a single score. Where multiple ISCO-2008 occupations map to a single SOC-2010 occupation, the automatability score for the single SOC-2010 occupation is mapped to all corresponding ISCO-2008 occupations. 31 non-military ISCO-2008 occupations do not have automobility scores based on this mapping. 28 of these 31 ISCO-2008 occupations are manually mapped to SOC-2010 based on the SOC-2010 and ISCO-2008 occupation titles and descriptions.<sup>6</sup> Next, the scores are mapped from ISCO-2008 occupations to MASCO-2013's 480 non-military occupations using a crosswalk developed by the World Bank in partnership with TalentCorp based on MASCO-2013 and ISCO-2008 occupation titles and descriptions.<sup>7</sup> Where multiple ISCO-2008

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> There are a total of 820 6-digit non-military occupations in SOC-2010.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> See <u>https://www.bls.gov/soc/soccrosswalks.htm</u> (last accessed June 18, 2018).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> The 3 for which good matches could not be identified are Legislators (1111); Astrologers, fortune-tellers and related workers (5161); and Fur and leather preparing machine operators (8155). These ISCO-2008 occupations are not assigned an automatability probability.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Creating the crosswalk between MASCO-2013 and ISCO-2008 involved several steps. First, the seven military occupations in MASCO-2013 were dropped, resulting in 480 MASCO-2013 occupations. Second, since MASCO-2013 was developed based on ISCO and many occupations have identical titles and codes, MASCO-2013 was matched to ISCO-2008 using the occupation code. 344 of the 480 MASCO-2018 occupations were matched in this way. A validation exercise comparing the MASCO-2013 and ISCO-2008 occupation titles and job descriptions confirmed the matches. Third, a fuzzy matching technique based on the similarity of MASCO-2013 and ISCO-2008 occupation titles was used to match an additional 79 matches. A validation exercise

occupations map to a single MASCO-2013 occupation, the closest match from ISCO-2008 is selected based on the MASCO-2013 and ISCO-2008 occupation titles and descriptions.<sup>8</sup> Where multiple MASCO-2013 occupations map to a single ISCO-2008 occupation, the automatability score for the single ISCO-2008 occupation is mapped to all corresponding MASCO-2013 occupations. This results in automatability probabilities for 477 of the 480 MASCO-2013 occupations and for all of the occupations included on the 2017/2018 Critical Occupations List.<sup>9</sup> The automatability probabilities for each MASCO-2013 occupation are matched to the 2016 Malaysian Labour Force Survey (LFS) and the 2016 Salary and Wages Survey (SWS), which both include 4-digit MASCO-2013 occupation codes.<sup>10</sup>

This adaptation of the automatability probabilities estimated in Frey and Osborne (2017) has been undertaken in numerous reports and research papers. See, for example, Chang and Huyng (2016) for Cambodia, Indonesia, the Philippines, Thailand, and Vietnam; Lamb (2016) for Canada; and Deloitte (2014) for the United Kingdom and London. A partial adaptation of Frey and Osborne (2017) was undertaken for Malaysia in Ng (2017). However, the analysis in Ng (2017) is limited by the use of 30 MASCO-2013 occupational groupings, rather than the 480 detailed occupations used in this report. This means that the author must average many automation probabilities in Frey and Osborne (2017) in order to obtain a single score for each of the 30 groupings. Ng (2017) acknowledges that "the results should be interpreted as an approximation rather than a precise replication of the exact methods of Frey and Osborne (2017)..." (Ng 2017 at p.6)

The methodology employed in the report makes the assumption that occupations in Malaysia involve the same set of skills as corresponding occupations in the United States since automatability scores from the United States are applied to Malaysian occupations. While there is some evidence of

comparing the MASCO-2013 and ISCO-2008 occupation titles and job descriptions confirmed the matches. Finally, the remaining 57 occupations were matched manually. To do so, the MASCO-2013 and ISCO-2008 occupations were matched based on their descriptions and tasks. For example, "Ship/Marine technicians" in MASCO-2013 (occupation code 3152) was matched to "Ships' engineers" in ISCO-2008 (occupation code 3151), because of the similarity of the tasks involved. According to the task descriptions, the tasks of these occupation categories in both MASCO-2013 and ISCO-2008 include: examining engines to locate defects using various tools and instruments and performing technical supervision of the installation, maintenance and repair of ships' machinery and equipment. In cases in which a best fit was still unclear, the MASCO-2013 occupation was mapped to a corresponding ISCO-2008 category for "other" or "not elsewhere classified." An example of a case in which the MASCO-2013 occupation was mapped to an "other" or "not elsewhere classified" category is that of "Legal managers" in MASCO-2013, which was mapped to the ISCO-2008 occupation "Professional services managers not elsewhere classified." For a similar procedure, see Chang and Huyng (2016).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> This occurs in the case of three MASCO-2013 occupations: Transport Technicians Not Elsewhere Classified (3159); Receptionists (4224); and Tailors, Dressmakers, Furriers and Hatters (7621). These are matched to three ISCO-2008 occupations, respectively: Town and Traffic Planners (2164); Receptionists (General) (4226); and Tailors, Dressmakers, Furriers and Hatters (7531).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> The MASCO-2013 occupations without automatability probabilities are the same 3 occupations for which good matches could not be identified between ISCO-2008 and SOC-2010: Legislators (1111); Astrologers, fortune-tellers and related workers (5161); and Fur and leather preparing machine operators (8155). <sup>10</sup> Eleven occupations matched to MASCO-2013 do not appear in either the 2016 LFS or the 2016 SWS data: Legal Managers (1617); Services Managers Not Elsewhere Classified (1629); Audiologists and Speech Therapists (2266); Occupational Therapists (2268); Database and Network Professionals Not Elsewhere Classified (2529); Clowns, Magicians, Acrobats and Related Professionals (2847); Nuclear Research and Development Associate Professionals (3161); Health Associate Professionals Not Elsewhere Classified (3259); Surface and Window Cleaners (9123); Agricultural, Forestry, Farming, and Fishery Labourers Not Elsewhere Classified (9219); and Water and Firewood Collectors (9624).

differences in the skills required in occupations between developing countries and the United States, this evidence is for countries at lower levels of development than Malaysia, and there is evidence that these differences moderate as countries develop (Dicarlo et al. 2016). To the extent that the results are biased by this assumption, it is likely that they show less automation than they would otherwise because the skills content of jobs in the United States is likely higher than that in Malaysia (Aedo, et al. 2013). That is, the automatability probabilities are likely lower-bound estimates.

# B. Task scores

Frey and Osborne (2017)'s methodology analyses the probability of automation at the level of occupations. However, technologies may automate *tasks* rather than entire *occupations* (Arntz, Gregory, and Zierahn 2016; Autor 2015). This implies that occupations may evolve due to automation, rather than be automated out of existence.

In order to address this possibility, this report incorporates an additional indicator of automatability based on the task composition of occupations. In a seminal paper, Autor, Levy, and Murnane (2003) hypothesize that cognitive and manual tasks that are *routine* - tasks that "follow explicit programmed rules" and "can be exhaustively specified with programmed instructions and performed by machines" – are more susceptible to automation. In contrast, analytical and interpersonal cognitive tasks and manual physical tasks that are *non-routine* – tasks that "cannot at present be described in terms of a set of programmable rules" - are more susceptible to automation (Autor, Levy, and Murnane 2003 at p.1283). To measure the intensity of use of routine and non-routine tasks in different occupations, and thus to measure how susceptible different occupations are to automation, Acemoglu and Autor (2011) build on Autor, Levy, and Murnane (2003) and identify 16 measures of the importance of different tasks in different occupations that capture 5 categories of routine and non-routine tasks: non-routine cognitive analytical tasks, non-routine cognitive interpersonal tasks, and non-routine manual physical tasks, which are less susceptible to automation; and routine cognitive and routine manual tasks, which are more susceptible to automation.<sup>11</sup> This allows the authors to show how intensively each of these 5 categories of routine and nonroutine tasks is used in each occupation. This, in turn, shows how susceptible each occupation is to automation based on its task composition, rather than assuming an entire occupation is or is not automatable.

This report adapts the methodology of Acemoglu and Autor (2011). Scores for each of the 16 task measures for each of the 5 categories of routine and non-routine tasks are obtained from the O\*NET database. **Table 1** shows these task measures and their corresponding skills categories. The scores are available from O\*NET in the O\*NET SOC-2010 occupational classification scheme, which is similar to but distinct from the SOC-2010 classification scheme. Out of the 1,110 O\*NET SOC-2010 occupations, 966 have data on the task measures included in Acemoglu and Autor (2011). As with the automatability probabilities, these scores must be translated into MASCO-2013.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> See also Autor and Handel (2013). Frey and Osborne (2017) argue that developments in machine learning and robotics are making many non-routine tasks automatable.

Skill category	O*NET task measure
Non-routine cognitive analytical	Analysing Data or Information
	Thinking Creatively
	Interpreting the Meaning of Information for Others
Non-routine cognitive interpersonal	Establishing and Maintaining Interpersonal Relationships
	Guiding, Directing, and Motivating Subordinates
	Coaching and Developing Others
Non-routine manual physical	Manual Dexterity
	Spatial Orientation
	Operating Vehicles, Mechanized Devices, or Equipment
	Spend Time Using Your Hands to Handle, Control, or Feel Objects, Tools, or Controls
Routine cognitive	Importance of Repeating Same Tasks
	Importance of Being Exact or Accurate
	Structured versus Unstructured Work
Routine manual	<b>Controlling Machines and Processes</b>
	Pace Determined by Speed of Equipment
	Spend Time Making Repetitive Motions

Table 1: O\*NET task measures used to construct skills categories

Source: O\*NET based on Acemoglu and Autor (2011).

The scores are first mapped from the O\*NET SOC-2010 classification scheme to the 840 SOC-2010 occupations using a crosswalk provided by O\*NET.<sup>12</sup> Where multiple O\*NET SOC-2010 occupations map to a single SOC-2010 occupation, a simple average of the task measures is taken to obtain a single score for each SOC-2010 occupation. The scores are then mapped from SOC-2010 occupations to ISCO-2008 using a crosswalk file provided by the United States Bureau of Labour Statistics.<sup>13</sup> Where multiple SOC-2010 occupations map to a single ISCO-2008 occupation, a simple average is taken to obtain a single score. Where multiple ISCO-2008 occupations map to a single SOC-2010 occupation, the task score for the single SOC-2010 occupation is mapped to all corresponding ISCO-2008 occupations. The scores are then mapped from ISCO-2008 occupations to MASCO-2013's 480 occupations using a crosswalk developed by the World Bank in partnership with TalentCorp based on MASCO-2013 and ISCO-2008 occupation titles and descriptions.<sup>14</sup> Where multiple ISCO-2008 occupations map to a single MASCO-2013 occupation, the closest match is selected based on the MASCO-2013 and ISCO-2008 occupation titles and descriptions.<sup>15</sup> Where multiple MASCO-2013 occupations map to a single ISCO-2008 occupation, the automatability score for the single ISCO-2008 occupation is mapped to all corresponding MASCO-2013 occupations. This results in task scores for 468 MASCO-2013 4-digit occupations and for all of the occupations included on the 2017/2018

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> See <u>https://www.onetcenter.org/crosswalks.html</u> (last accessed June 18, 2018).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> See <u>https://www.bls.gov/soc/soccrosswalks.htm</u> (last accessed June 18, 2018).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> See Footnote 7.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> See Footnote 8.

Critical Occupations List.<sup>16</sup> Finally, the scores on each of the 16 measures are averaged within the 5 categories of routine and nonroutine tasks to derive a composite score for each category. While Acemoglu and Autor (2011) provide a normalized score expressed with mean zero and standard deviation one, the report provides raw scores weighted by employment for ease of interpretation. The O\*NET scores for each MASCO-2013 occupation are also matched to the 2016 Malaysian Labour Force Survey (LFS) and the 2016 Salary and Wages Survey (SWS), which both include 4-digit MASCO-2013 occupation codes.<sup>17</sup>

As in the estimation of automation probabilities, the methodology employed in the report makes the assumption that occupations in Malaysia have the same skill intensities as those in the United States since the task measures from the United States are applied to Malaysian occupations. As noted above, to the extent that the results are biased by this assumption, it is likely that occupations in Malaysia that involve more non-routine tasks (that is, are less susceptible to automation) are less intensive in these non-routine tasks than similar occupations in the United States (Aedo, et al. 2013). Overall, then, this would mean these occupations would be more susceptible to automation than in the United States.

A similar approach to replicating Acemoglu and Autor (2011) has been undertaken and extended in Aedo et al. (2013), Arias et al. (2014), and Dicarlo et al. (2016).

# C. Qualitative assessment of automatability

Frey and Osborne (2017)'s methodology does not take into account several factors that may influence the pace and breadth of adoption of technologies that permit automation. These factors relate to the depth of technological adoption in an economy (e.g., top tier firms may adopt the most advanced technologies but smaller firms may face barriers to doing so); the relative prices of capital and labour (e.g., the abundance of labour may mean that investments in labour-saving technology are not cost-effective); and legal, ethical, and normative obstacles to technology adoption (e.g. human preferences to interact with humans may slow replacement of human labour, even where technologies exist to do so) (Arntz, Gregory, and Zierahn 2016).

In order to take these additional factors into account, experts in data science, human resources, and Malaysian industry were asked to provide guidance on the role of these barriers in Malaysia. For each COL occupation, the experts were asked the following three Yes/No questions:

- Have firms beyond the top tier adopted technologies that can be used to automate this occupation?
- Do the current average labour costs favour the adoption of labour-reducing technologies that can be used to automate this occupation?
- Are there existing laws, regulations, or normative constraints that would oppose the automation of this occupation?

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> The 12 occupations that do not have O\*NET scores are Legislators (1111); Clowns, Magicians, Acrobats and Related Professionals (2847); Creative and Performing Artists Not Elsewhere Classified (2849); Religious Associate Professionals (3612); Pawnbrokers and Money-Lenders (4213); Astrologers, Fortune-Tellers and Related Workers (5161); Building Structure Cleaners (7133); Fur and Leather Preparing Machine Operators (8155); Textile, Fur and Leather Products Machine Operators Not Elsewhere Classified (8159); Animal-Drawn Vehicles Drivers (9332); Street and Related Service Workers (9511); and Sweepers and Related Labourers (9613).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> See Footnote 10.

Answers to these questions are compiled using a "stoplight" approach: when a factor is unanimously cited as a constraint to automation, the constraint is considered to be binding; when a factor is unanimously cited not to be a constraint to automation, the constraint is considered not to be binding; when there is no consensus, evidence is considered to be mixed. This approach is designed to provide qualitative information about potential barriers to automation that are difficult to describe in systematic measures of the automatability of occupations.

As noted above in the description of the task scores methodology, automation may affect individual tasks within an occupation without eliminating the entire occupation. In order to address this possibility, the same experts were also surveyed about important characteristics to consider when evaluating the automatability of each COL occupation, particularly the kinds of tasks in each occupation that are more susceptible to automation and the kinds of tasks that are less susceptible to automation. Responses were elicited in the form of an open-ended question, and have been edited for inclusion in the profiles.

### **APPENDIX 2: ADDITIONAL RESULTS**

The probability of automation varies with gender, citizenship, education, and wage. A higher percentage of women work in occupations that are at high risk of automation than men (**Figure 7**). A much larger share of non-citizens work in occupations that are at high risk of automation than Malaysian citizens (**Figure 8**). The share of workforce that is at low risk of automation generally increases with education (**Figure 9**). Finally, wages generally decline with the probability of automation, suggesting that the occupations that are at most risk of automation are the lowest-paying, lowest-skilled jobs (**Figure 10**)









Source: World Bank based on Frey and Osborne (2017) and LFS (2016).

Source: World Bank based on Frey and Osborne (2017) and LFS (2016).







Source: World Bank based on Frey and Osborne (2017) and LFS (2016).



Figure 10: Average median monthly wage in Malaysia in 2016 by probability of automation

Source: World Bank based on Frey and Osborne (2017) and SWS (2016).

#### REFERENCES

- Acemoglu, Daron and David Autor. 2011. "Skills, Tasks and Technologies: Implications for Employment and Earnings." In *Handbook of Labor Economics*, Volume 4B, edited by Orley Ashenfelter and David Card, 1043-171.
- ADB (Asian Development Bank). 2018. Asian Development Outlook 2018: How Technology Affects Jobs. Manila: ADB.
- Aedo, Cristian, Jesko Hentschel, Javier Luque, and Martín Moreno. 2013. "From Occupations to Embedded Skills: A Cross-Country Comparison," Background Paper for the World Development Report 2013, World Bank, Washington D.C.
- Arias, Omar, Carolina Sánchez-Páramo, María E. Dávalos, Indhira Santos, Erwin R. Tiongson, Carola Gruen, Natasha de Adrade Falcão, Gady Saiovici, and Cesar A. Cancho. 2014. *Back to Work: Growing with Jobs in Europe and Central Asia*. Washington D.C.: World Bank.
- Arntz, Melanie, Terry Gregory, and Ulrich Zierahn. 2016. "The Risk of Automation for Jobs in OECD Countries." OECD Social, Employment and Migration Working Papers No. 189, OECD, Paris.
- Autor, David H. 2015. "Why Are There Still So Many Jobs? The History and Future of Workplace Automation." *Journal of Economic Perspectives* 29(3):3-30.
- Autor, David H. and Michael J. Handel. 2013. "Putting Tasks to the Test: Human Capital, Job Tasks, and Wages," *Journal of Labor Economics* 31(2):S59-96.
- Autor, David H., Frank Levy, and Richard J. Murnane. 2003. "The Skill Content of Recent Technological Change: An Empirical Exploration." *The Quarterly Journal of Economics* 118(4):1279-333.
- Chang, Jae-Hee and Phu Huynh. 2016. "ASEAN in Transformation: The Future of Jobs at Risk of Automation." Bureau of Employers' Activities Working Paper No. 9, International Labour Office, Geneva.
- Centre for Strategic Futures. 2015. "Foresight," Centre for Strategic Future, Singapore.
- CSC (Critical Skills Monitoring Committee). 2018. *Critical Occupations List 2017/2018: Occupation Report*. Institute of Labour Market Information and Analysis and TalentCorp, Kuala Lumpur.
- CSC (Critical Skills Monitoring Committee). 2018b. *Critical Occupations List 2017/2018: Technical Report*. Institute of Labour Market Information and Analysis, TalentCorp, and World Bank, Kuala Lumpur.
- Davenport, Thomas H. and Keith J. Dreyer. 2018. "AI Will Change Radiology, But It Won't Replace Radiologists," Harvard Business Review, March 27, 2018. <u>https://hbr.org/2018/03/ai-willchange-radiology-but-it-wont-replace-radiologists</u> (last accessed June 25, 2018).
- Deloitte. 2014. "Agiletown: the Relentless March of Technology and London's Response." Deloitte, London.

- Dicarlo, Emanuele, Salvatore Lo Bello, Sebastian Monroy-Taborda, Ana Maria Oviedo, Maria Laura Sanchez-Puerta, and Indhira Santos. 2016. "The Skill Content of Occupations across Low and Middle Income Countries: Evidence from Harmonized Data." Discussion Paper No. 10244, IZA, Bonn.
- Frey, Carl Benedikt and Michael A. Osborne. 2017. "The Future of Employment: How Susceptible Are Jobs to Computerisation?" *Technological Forecasting & Social Change* 114:254-80.
- Lamb, Creig. 2016. "The Talented Mr. Robot: The Impact of Automation on Canada's Workforce." Brookfield Institute for Innovation and Entrepreneurship, Toronto.